

Real life Discussion with a local Madkhali- Extereme Salafi.

<http://www.muftisays.com/forums/the-true-salaf-as-saliheen/4504/real-life-discussion-with-a-local-madkhali-%28extreme-salafi%29.html?pg=1>

Muadh Khan: Asslamu Allaikum

Madkhali: W-Salam Brother

Muadh Khan: What are you calling these Reverts to do?

Madkhali: To follow the Qur'aan and Authentic Hadeeth!

Muadh Khan: What is your evidence for that?

Madkhali: Allah (SWT) has commanded us to follow Allah (SWT) and His Rasul (Sallaho Alaihe Wassallam).

Muadh Khan: That is different to following Qur'aan and Authentic Hadeeth.

Madkhali: But we can only follow Allah (SWT) and His Rasool (Sallaho Alaihe Wassallam) by following Qur'aan and Hadeeth according to the ways of the Salaf

Muadh Khan: So you are implying that following Allah (SWT) and His Rasul (Sallaho Alaihe Wassallam) is equal to following Qur'aan and and Authentic Hadeeth? You don't really have any direct evidence!

Madkhali: Yes its implied.

Muadh Khan: Fine. How is a new Muslim supposed to do that? How is he/she meant to distinguish Hadeeth and practise how to pray Salah?

Madkhali: He/She is supposed to take the STRONGEST opinion in matters of praying Salah, Wudhu etc.

Muadh Khan: How? This person became Muslim 6 months ago? They hardly know their Salah so how are they supposed to do research?

Madkhali: They are supposed to read books with Authentic Fiqh opinions like Fiqhus-Sunnah

Muadh Khan: (Turning to the Reverts): The book he is referring to was written by an Egyptian Shaykh called "sayyid sabiq" who didn't even have a proper Beard. google and look up his picture!

Madkhali: Yes, he made a mistake in Beard!

Muadh Khan: (Turning to the Reverts) He is telling you to follow a guy who made a mistake in a matter in which there is ABSOLUTELY NO DIFFERENCE of opinion amongst any of the Salaf

Madkhali: He made a mistake in this matter

Muadh Khan: He made a mistake in a matter in which there is no difference of opinion so how can I trust him in other matters?

Madkhali: Ignores the argument :-)

Muadh Khan: So how is a Revert or even a Muslim supposed to follow Islam?

Madkhali: You tell me?

Muadh Khan: By asking the Ulama because Allah (SWT) has commanded Muslims to query and follow the Ulama as Allah (SWT) says in the Qur'aan:

Surah An-Nahl, verse 21

Do you deny this verse of the Qur'aan?

Madkhali: No, this is in the Qur'aan.

Muadh Khan: In that case you are guilty of making them act in contradiction to the Qur'aan because you are NOT a Scholar. Are you a Scholar?

Madkhali: No

Muadh Khan: So they are acting in contradiction to the Qur'aan by asking and you are acting in contradiction to the Qur'aan by answering...

Madkhali: they are supposed to follow Authentic evidence!

Muadh Khan: How? They hardly know how to read Surah Al-Fatiha with Tajweed

Madkhali: They should follow Shaykh Al-Albani (RA) and his research on Hadeeth

Muadh Khan: Isn't that Taqleed? :-)

Madkhali: He is one of the greatest Scholars of Hadeeth of our time?

Muadh Khan: Where is your evidence for that? Do you agree or disagree that its Taqleed?

Madkhali: Because Scholars of our time trust him?

Muadh Khan: That is no evidence from Qur'aan and Sunnah. You are suggesting a name and suggesting other names to confirm the first name? I thought these guys were supposed to follow "Qur'aan and Authentic Hadeeth"

Madkhali: Where is your evidence to follow Imam Abu Haneefa (RA)?

Muadh Khan: Rasul-ullah (Sallaho Alaihe Wassallam) said, ""The best of my people are my generation then those who come after them, then those who come after them, then there will come a people in whom there will be no good." [Tabarni]

Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) was born in year 80 AH and passed away in year 160AH so he was Tab'ae and he narrates Hadeeth from Sahaba (RA) so he is the Salaf!

Do you deny him being Salaf?

Madkhali: No I don't deny him being the Salaf.

Muadh Khan: So you are taking these people away from following one of the Salaf to another Scholar who passed away in 1999! That is very strange dawah.

Madkhali: But Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) said "If the Hadeeth is Saheeh ignore my words"

Muadh Khan: Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) said no such thing! You are wrong

Madkhali: Sorry Imam Shafa'e (RA) said this

Muadh Khan: Give me the chain of this saying...

Madkhali: Imam Shaf'ae (RA) narrates from who narrates from Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA) who narrates from Abdullah Ibn Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA)...

Muadh Khan: What?

Madkhali: Imam Shaf'ae (RA) narrates from who narrates from Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA) who narrates from Abdullah Ibn Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA)...

Muadh Khan: What?

Madkhali: Imam Shaf'ae (RA) narrates from who narrates from Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA) who narrates from Abdullah Ibn Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA)...

Muadh Khan: (Turning to the Reverts) He is talking about Imam Shaf'ae (RA) narrating from the FATHER and then the FATHER narrating from the SON

They were 35 years apart...how can someone narrate from the father and then the Son...Its absurd...

Madkhali: I am saying Imam Shaf'ae (RA) narrates from Abdullah Ibn Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA) who narrates from Ahmed Ibn Hanbal (RA) who narrates from ...

Muadh Khan: I made you repeat your mistake three time...

Madkhali: I never said that...you are twisting my words. You think I am stupid?

Muadh Khan: So far you have made mistake after mistake after mistake

Madkhali: I do know what I am talking about...You are making fun of me in front of everyone

Muadh Khan: You are not helping me :-) But go on whats the statement

Madkhali: "If the Hadeeth is saheeh, then ignore my words"

Muadh Khan: Do you know who is regarded as the most Authentic Scholars of Shaf'ae Madhab? It is Imam Nawawi (RA), do you know what he says about this?

Madkhali: No.

Muadh Khan: Imam Nawawi (RA) says in Al-Majmu that this statement is referred to TOP Ulama who are capable of Ijtehaad i.e. a Mujtahid Imam and after thoroughly researching the matter if he is convinced that the Hadeeth didn't reach Imam Shafa'e (RA) or if the Authenticity was differed then the Mujtahid can follow the Hadeeth over the Madhab.

Are you a Mujtahid? Or are these people who became Muslim six months ago Mujtahids?

Madkhali: We are supposed to follow the Authentic Hadeeth in Bukhari & Muslim...

Muadh Khan: (Interrupts!) Where is the evidence for that?

Madkhali: What do you mean where is the evidence for that? Don't you agree that Ahadeeth in Bukhari & Muslim are Authentic?

Muadh Khan: We are supposed to follow the evidence of Qur'aan & Sunnah so where is the evidence is that Ahadeeth in Bukhari & Muslim are Authentic?

Madkhali: Ulama have agreed upon the matter and relied upon Saheeh Bukhari.

Muadh Khan: This is something very strange! You are relying on the research of Imam Bukari who wasn't a Salaf and you quote the confidence and acceptance of Ulama you have no problems with that. But you have a problem with the Madhab of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) who was a Salaf and Ulama also accepted his Madhab.

So how come your acceptance of Ulama is evidence for the correctness of Saheeh Bukhari but acceptance of Ulama is not evidence in case of Madhab of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA).

Which verse of the Qur'aan or Hadeeth authenticates Saheeh Bukhari?

Madkhali: We are supposed to follow the Salaf As-Salihoon!

Muadh Khan: I don't know any Muslim group or individual who claims to follow anybody else. Please show me evidence where someone either claims or has written that they don't follow Salaf As-Salihoon! I would really like to see this

Madkhali: Why have you obligated following a Madhab when there is no evidence for it in the Qur'aan & Sunnah? You cannot obligate something which isn't obligated in the Qur'aan and Sunnah?

Muadh Khan: Are you aware of Shaykh Bin Baaz (RA) 's Fatwa on smoking and wearing high heels?

Madkhali: Which one? What are you talking about?

Muadh Khan: Shaykh (RA) has declared smoking and wearing high heels Haram for Muslims and amongst the evidence are two verses of the Qur'aan and they are as follows:

"And do not kill yourselves" [al-Nisa' 4:29]

"and do not throw yourselves into destruction" [al-Baqarah 2:195]

Can you show me why Shaykh Bin-Baaz (RA) has obligated women to ABSTAIN from wearing high heels? Where is the obligation for that?

We are not discussing the right or wrong but this is an example where Ulama have obligated something which isn't directly obligated in the Qur'aan & Sunnah.

But for Madhabs the issue of Taqleed has been ordered in Surah Nahl (verse 43). Madhabs are just an extension and research from the time of Rasul-ullah (Sallaho Alaihe Wassallam) as shown in this following Authentic Athar:

Abu Ayub al-Ansari (RA) was once on his way to Hajj and lost his camels he brought to be sacrificed (and by which a person comes out of Ihram). On the day of sacrifice he came to Umar and asked him what to do? Umar (RA) told him to do as those who perform Umrah do (that is to shave or cut their hair), and you will be out of Ihram. Then in the next year do Hajj and make the sacrifice.

(Muwatta Imam Malik).

Note, here neither did Abu Ayub (RA) ask for proof nor was it given, a clear example of Taqlid in the time of Sahaba (RA).

Can you show me where it is obligated for Abu Ayub al-Ansari (RA) to follow Sayyidina Umar (RA)?

Pick up any earlier book of Islam and therein you will see opinions of Sufyan At-Thawri (RA), Ibraheem An-Nakhai (RA) and other Sahaba & Taba'een (RA) and that's it...THEIR OPINIONS are clearly quoted so let me ask you why are the opinions of INDIVIDUALS being quoted but if they are not meant to followed? And if you say that the opinion of the Salaf is to be followed then why single out Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) for not following?

Madkhali: We don't have the opinion of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) today!

Muadh Khan: Imam Muhammad (RA) was a student of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) and he also studied with Imam Malik (RA). As a result he also narrated Muwatta of Imam Malik (RA) and under each chapter he narrates the opinion of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA). This has been translated and published in English as "Muwatta Imam Muhammad (RA)".

According to Imam Shaf'ae (RA) the most Authentic book on Earth after the book of Allah (SWT) is "Muwatta of Imam Malik (RA)".

Muwatta Imam Muhammad (RA) is that PLUS the opinions of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA). So the book is compiled by "Salaf", Authenticated by "Salaf" and contains opinion of "Salaf" in addition to Hadeeth.

Go look it up!

Now off course we consider Saheeh Bukhari (RA) to be more Authentic and that's a different discussion all together.

Madkhali: There is no obligation to follow Imam Abu Haneefa (RA), exclusively?

Muadh Khan: I was trying to make a point about Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) and him being a Salaf but we actually follow the "Madhab of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA)" which means that Ulama have scrutinised opinions and where the evidence is to the contrary we leave the words of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA).

If you actually study the Madhab, you will find opinion after opinion where Imam Abu Yusuf (RA) and Imam Muhammad (RA) have disagreed with their teacher i.e. Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) based on evidence and Ulama discuss these matters and adopt the most sound opinion.

But this is NOT the job of a laymen. Until you become a Mujtahid you have no choice but to do Taqleed.

The obligation for laymen as Shaykh Salih Uthaymeen (RA) has rightly pointed out is "Taqleed".

Madkhali: I was trying to ask the Brothers about their evidence of praying Sunnah Salah when Fardh (of Fajar) has started?

Muadh Khan: Where is your evidence that you are supposed to going around and asking people for evidence? Show me examples from the lives of Salaf where they went around and questioned people in this manner?

Madkhali: This is for gaining knowledge.

Muadh Khan: This is the easiest part and I will provide you the evidence, Insha'Allah.

<http://www.central-mosque.com/fiqh/fajarsunnah.htm>

The seal of approval about Imam Abu Haneefa (RA) and his companions is

accepted by the Ummah, EVEN YOU!

Madkhali: What? Where?

Muadh Khan: Imam Tahawi (RA) starts the treatise of Aqeedah as:  
<http://www.central-mosque.com/aqeedah/tahawi.htm>

*The great scholar Hujjat al-Islam Abu Ja'far al-Warraq al-Tahawi al-Misri, may Allah have mercy on him, said: This is a presentation of the beliefs of Ahl al-Sunna wa al-Jama`a, according to the school of the jurists of this religion, Abu Hanifa al-Nu`man ibn Thabit al-Kufi, Abu Yusuf Ya`qub ibn Ibrahim al-Ansari and Abu `Abdullah Muhammad ibn al-Hasan al-Shaybani, may Allah be pleased with them all, and what they believe regarding the fundamentals of the religion and their faith in the Lord of the worlds.*

**What makes them trustworthy in Aqeedah and unreliable in Fiqh? Why can people follow them in Aqeedah but not in Fiqh?**

Let me ask you something?

Muadh Khan: This If I quote you a **Hadeeth** and you are not sure about the Authenticity of it, what will you do?

Madkhali: I will ask the Scholars.

Muadh Khan: So you will take their opinion?

Madkhali: Yes because I am not a Scholar!

Muadh Khan: So do you have a problem with these people in the **Masjid** trusting Scholars and following the **Madhab** of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA)? You and they are doing the same thing EXCEPT that they are following "Salaf" while you are following some Scholar of today?

Madkhali: Akhi! I didn't mean to debate with you and we shouldn't waste our time in discussions

Muadh Khan: I have no problems debating and discussing with you, anywhere, anytime BUT get your facts straight and don't make silly mistakes in quoting things.

Asslamo Allaikum,

**Brother doesn't come to our Masjid as much anymore and his Halaqah has been broken up and we have various Ulama & Huffadh doing Arabic, Fiqh & Tajweed Halaqahs instead.**

**After our discussion all of the Reverts attended "The Legacy of Imam Abu Haneefa (RA)" conference and a brother got a text message the same night saying "I am a Hanafi, now..."**

**It was the talks and presentations of Ulama which shook these brothers up and made them realise that there is something in "Taqlaed". Mufti Ibn Adam has a very good way of making people understand his point, Masha'Allah.**

**They have also spent time with Jamaat. We had numerous discussions about Jamaat work and evidence from Qur'aan & Sunnah with brothers which I have not posted.**

**Their wives are also attending Halaqahs with another Sister but unfortunately serious effort needs to be made on the "Woman's front" in UK. This is an area which is hurting us a lot throughout the country not many knowledgeable Sisters and Alimahs are doing their job.**