

Raful Yadain

The Question of Raf-ul-Yadain - Raising Of Hands in Salah

Video added as some may not like to read. (On the Blog Post,Link below)

I admit this is a bit long, but I think it is important that we know that the evidence does exist.

One day, I was having a discussion with a brother and by chance we went onto Raful Yadain. As soon as I mentioned the Hadith of ibn Masud on "Shall I perform Salah". The brother instantly said this was weak, I got so angry but I had to keep my temper down. I even asked him who was weak in the chain of narrations when there were only a few people in the chain. There was no answer except the that the scholars have said that this was weak.

I know where this sort of stuff comes from so I thought this would be very useful for those who follow the Hanafi School. This is not to go against the Shafi'ee school as all 4 schools are respected equally.

This is an article that will InshaAllah shed some light on why we dont raise our hands in Salah.

In this article, we shall give forty-two (42) Sahih evidences for the issue of not raising the hands in the Hanafi Madhhab.

The Question of Raf-ul-Yadain

Introduction

In this article, we shall give forty-two (42) Sahih evidences for the issue of not raising the hands in the Hanafi Madhhab. This article is a reproduction of an excellent booklet written by Majlis ul-Ulama of South Africa

NARRATIONAL EVIDENCE

Although the Hanafi Madhhab has also rational evidence for its view regarding Rafa' Yadain, this booklet discusses only the Naqli (narrational) evidence on which is based the Hanafi practice of abstention from Rafa' Yadain. The primary basis of all acts of Ibaadat is narrational evidence, not rational proofs. Rational proof is simply adduced as additional substantiation to strengthen an argument.

AHAADITH OF SAYYIDINA RASULULLAH Sallallahu alayhi wa aalihi wa Sallam

Proof 1

Uthmaan Bin Abi Shaibah - Wakee' - Sufyaan - Aasim (Ibn Kulaib) - Abdur Rahmaan Bin Aswad - Alqamah said: Abdullah Bin Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

'Should I not perform with you the Salaat of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)?'

Alqamah said: 'Then he (Ibn Mas'ood) performed Salaat and he did not raise his hands except once.' (Abu Dawood)

Proof 2

Hasan Bin Ali - Muaawiyah - Khaalid Bin Amr Bin Saeed - Abu Huzaifah. They said Sufyaan narrated to us with this same isnaad (as mentioned in No. 1 above). He said:

'He (Ibn Mas'ood) raised his hands in the beginning once.' Some narrators said: 'one time'. (Abu Dawood)

Proof 3

Hannaad - Wakee' - Sufyaan - Aasim bin Kulaib - Abdur Rahmaan bin Al Aswad - Alqamah who said: 'Abdullah Bin Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"Should I not perform with you the Salaat of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)?"

He (Ibn Mas'ood) then performed Salaat and he did not raise his hands except in the beginning once.'

Tirmithi added also that in this regard there is also the narration of Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu): Tirmithi said:

"The Hadith of Ibn Mas'ood is Hasan.

*This is also the view of many of the Ulama among the Sahaabah of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) and the Taabieen. This is also the view of Sufyaan and the Ahl-e-Kufa (i.e. the Ulama of Kufa)."

* i.e. The view of Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu).

Proof 4

Mahmud Bin Ghailaan al-Marwazi - Wakee' - Sufyaan - Aasim Bin Kulaib - Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad - Alqamah - Abdullah (Bin Mas'ood): "Verily he said:

'Should I not perform with you the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)?'

He then performed Salaat and he did not raise his hands except once." (Nasaai)

Proof 5

Wakee' - Sufyaan - Aasim Bin Kulaib - Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad Alqamah said: "Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

'Should I not perform for you the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)?'

He then performed Salaat and he did not raise his hands except once." (Ahmad in his Musnad)

Proof 6

Suwaid Bin Nasr - Abdullah Bin al-Mubaarak - Sufyaan - Aasim Bin Kulaib - Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad - Alqamah - Abdullah (Bin Mas'ood radhiyallahu 'anhu) said:

"Should I not apprise you of the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)?"

Alqamah said: "He (Ibn Mas'ood) then stood up and firstly raised his hands. Thereafter he never repeated it." (Nasaai)

Proof 7

Wakee' - Sufyaan - Aasim Bin Kulaib - Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad Alqamah - Abdullah Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"Should I not show you the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)?"

"He then (performed Salaat) and did not raise his hands except once." (Abu Bakr Bin Abi Shaibah in his Musannaf)

Proof 8

Abu Uthmaan Saeed Bin Muhammad Bin Ahmad al-Hannaat and Abdul Wahhaab Bin Isaa Bin Abi Hayyah- (both from) - Ishaq Bin Abi Israaeel Muhammad Bin Jaabir - Hammaad - Ibraaheem - Alqamah - Abdullah (Ibn Mas'ood - radhiyallahu anhu) said:

“I performed Salaat with Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam), with Abu Bakr and Umar (radhiyallahu anhuma). They did not raise their hands except at the time of the first Takbeer in the opening of the Salaat.” (Daara Qutni)

Ibn Adi has also narrated the above Hadith with his sanad.

Proof 9

Ibn Abi Dawood - Nu'aim Bin Hamaad - Wakee' - Sufyaan - Aasim Bin Kulaib -Abdur Rahman Bin al-Aswad - Alqamah - Abdullah (Ibn Mas'ood - radhiyallahu anhu) narrated that Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would raise his hands in the first Takbeer. Then he would not do so again. (Tahaawi - Sharhi Ma-aanil Aathaar)

Proof 10

Muhammad Bin Nu'maan - Yahya Bin Yahya - Wakee' - Sufyaan narrated the same text (as above in No. 9) with the same isnaad. (Tahaawi - Sharhi Ma-aanil Aathaar)

Proof 11

Abu Bakrah - Muammal - Sufyaan narrating from Mugheerah said:

“I narrated the Hadith of Waa-il to Ibraaheem, that he (Waa-il) saw Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) raise his hands when he commenced Salaat, when he made ruku' and when he lifted his head from ruku'.”

Ibraaheem said: “If it is so that Waa-il saw him doing so once, then (remember that) Abdullah (Ibn Mas'ood) saw him (Rasulullah - Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) fifty times not doing this.” (Tahaawi - Sharhi Ma-aanil Aathaar)

Proof 12

Ahmad Bin Abi Dawood - Musaddid - Khaalid Bin AbdUllah - Husain Amr Bin Murrah who said:

“I entered the Masjid of Hadhra Maut and saw Atqamah Bin Waa-il narrating from his father

that Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would raise his hands before ruku' and after ruku'. I narrated this to Ibraaheem who became angry and said: 'Waa-il (radhiyallahu anhu) saw him. Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) and his companions did not see him (Rasulallah - doing so)?' (Tahaawi - Ma-aanil Aathaar)

Proof 13

The companions of Abu Hanifah said:

"Abu Hanifah said that Haremmad narrated from Ibraaheem who narrated from Alqamah and Al-Aswad from Abdullah Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) 'Verily Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would not raise his hands except at the time of commencing Salaat, then he did not at all repeat it. (The As-haab of the Masaaneed of Imaam Abu Hanifah)

Many other Muhadditheen have similarly narrated in their treatises, compilations and books.

Some of the asaaneed (chains of narration) of the Hadith of Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) are jayyid (excellent) in terms of the conditions laid down by Imaam Bukhaari and Imaam Muslim.

Some of these amaneed are Hasan. It is valid to cite a Hasan Hadith as proof. On the basis of some of the asaaneed of the Hadith of Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu), Hafiz Ibn Hazm, Daara Qutni, Ibnul Qattaan and others have declared the Hadith (of Ibn Mas'ood) to be Saheeh (authentic). Hafiz Ibn Hajr concurs with this verdict in his Talkhees on the Takhreej of Zaila-ee on Hidaayah."

In a Saheeh Sanad of this Hadith in the Masnad of Abu Bakr Bin Abi Shaibah are five narrators besides Abdullah Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu), viz. Wakee', Sufyaan, Aasim Bin Kulaib, Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad and Alqamah. The following are the comments of the authorities of Hadith on the status of these five narrators:

Wakee' Hafiz Ibn Hair says in Tahzeebut Tahzeeb: "Wakee' Bin al-Jarraah Bin Maleeh, is the Kufi narrator. He is known as Abu Sufyaan. He narrated from his father and from Ismaaeel Bin Khaalid, Aiman Bin: Waa-il, Ibn Hattn and from numerous others. His sons, Sufyaan, Malee' and Uyainah narrated from him. His Shaikh was Sufyaan Thauri, the two sons of Abi Shaibah, Abu Haithamah and Humaidi.

Abdullah Bin Ahmad Bin Hambal narrating from his father said: 'I have not seen a greater man of knowledge and a man with a greater memory than Wakee'.'"

Ahmad Bin Sahl Bin Bahr narrating from Imaam Ahmad said:

“Wakee’ was the Imaam of the Muslimeen in his time.”

Ibn Ma’een said: “I have not seen a better person than Wakee’.”

According to Mulla Ali Qaari, Wakee’ was among the highest ranking narrators of Bukhaari. He was of the Tab-e-Taabieen era. Imaam Abroad said that he preferred Wakee’ to Yahya Bin Saeed. He classified Wakee’ as a great and uprighteous Muhaddith. All the narrators of the Sihaah Sittah narrate from Wakee’.

Sufyaan Bin Saeed Bin Masrooq Thauri Kufi

According to Mulla Ali Qaari in his Tazkirah, Sufyaan was the Imaam of the Muslimeen and a Proof of Allah. His excellences are innumerable. In his time he was an expert in Fiqh, Ijtihad in Fiqh, Hadith and other branches of knowledge. His piety and authority are accepted by all the authorities of Islam. He too was among the Tab-e-Taabieen.

Abu Aasim said: ‘Sufyaan is the Ameerul Mu’mineen in Hadith.’ Numerous illustrious Ulama and Muhadditheen pay glowing tribute to the sterling qualities of Sufyaan.

All the narrators of the Sihaah Sittah narrate from Sufyaan.

Aasim Bin Kulaib

Mulla Ali Qaari states with regard to Aasim:

“He is Sadooq (extremely truthful), Thiqaah (an authoritative and authentic narrator).”

Yahya Bin Ma-een and Nasaai testified to his authenticity and authority in Hadith. Ibnul Qattaan al-Maghribi and Ibn Ham are renowned in Hadith circles. They are extremely severe in assessing narrators. Both have testified to the authenticity of Aasim Bin Kulaib. Muslim, Abu Dawood, Nasaai, Ibn Majah and Tirmithi narrated his ahaadith.

Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad

Mullah Ali El-Qaari says in his Tazkirah that Abdur Rahmaan is among the noblest Taa-bieen. His daily practice was 700 raka’ts Nafil Salaat. He would perform Isha and Fajr Salaat with one wudhu. He was an embodiment of Ibaadat.

In Tahzeebut Tahzeeb, Hafiz says:

“Abdur Rahman Bin al-Aswad heard Ahaadith from his paternal uncle, Alqamah Bin Qais. Aasim Bin Kulaib and others narrate from Abdur Rahman al-Aswad. Ibn Ma’een, Nasaai, Ajal, Ibn Kharraash and Ibn Hibbaan declared him a Thiqah (reliable and authentic narrator). The authors of Sihah Sittah narrated from him.

Alqamah Bin Qais

According to Mulla Ali Qaari in Tazkirah, Alqamah was a senior Taabiee. He narrated Ahaadith from Abdullah Ibn Mas’ood and other Sahaabah (radhiyallahu anhum). There is consensus of the Ulama on his greatness. Ibraaheem Nakha’i said:

“Alqamah resembled Abdullah Ibn Mas’ood (radhiyallahu anhu).”

Besides Ibn Majah all the other Muhadditheen narrate his ahaadith. He is of the second generation Muhadditheen.

The integrity and authority of these five illustrious narrators are unimpeachable. Thus, the sanad of the Hadith in Musnad of Abu Bakr Bin Abi Shaibah is Saheeh on the basis of the conditions of Bukhaari and Muslim. Similarly, the Sanad of Abu Dawood is Saheeh on the basis of the conditions of Bukhaari and Muslim. In the Sanad of Abu Dawood appears an extra narrator, viz. Uthmaan Bin Abi Shaibah from whom all the compilers of Sihah Sittah narrate, besides Tirmithi.

The Sanad of the Hadith of Tirmithi is Saheeh on the basis of Muslim’s conditions.

The sanad of Nasaai too is Saheeh in terms of the conditions of Bukhaari and Muslim because in this Sanad only Mahmud Bin Ghailaan has been added to Ibn Abi Shaibah. Besides Abu Dawood the other compilers of the Sihah Sittah narrated ahaadith from him (Mahmud Bin Ghailaan).

Similarly the sanad of Imaam Abu Hanifah regarding the Hadith of Ibn Mas’ood (radhiyallahu anhu) is Saheeh because all the narrators besides Hammaad Bin Abi Sulaimaan are reliable (thiqah) in terms of the conditions of Bukhaari and Muslim. Besides Bukhaari, Muslim and other Muhadditheen narrate from Hammaad Bin Abi Sulaimaan. Thus, his sanad is Saheeh in terms of Muslim.

The Hadith of Baraa’ Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) also conin’ms that Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) raised his hands only once at the time of Takbeer Tahreemah. His Hadith is narrated by Abdur Razzaaq, Ahmad, Abu Dawood, Ibn Abi Shaibah, Tahaawi, Daara Qutni and others.

Proof 14

Abdur Razzaq - Ibn Uyainah- Yazeed - Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"When Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) recited Takbeer, he would raise his hands until we could see his thumbs near to his ears. Thereafter he would not repeat it in that Salaat." (Abdur Razzaq' s Jaami')

Proof 15

Imaam Ahmad -Hushaim - Yazeed Bin Abi Ziyaad - Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa - Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"When Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) recited Takbeer, he would raise his hands until we could see his thumbs near to his ears. Then he would not repeat (Rafa' Yadain) in that Salaat." (Musnad Ahmad ibn Hambal)

Proof 16

Abu Dawood - Muhammad Bin Sabaah al-Bazaar - Shareek- Yazid Bin Abi Ziyaad - Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa - Baraa' (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"Verily, Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would raise his hands near to his ears when he opened (i.e. began) the Salaat, then he would not repeat (it)." (Abu Dawood)

Proof 17

Abu Dawood - Husain Bin Abdur Rahman - Wakee' - Ibn Abi Lailaa - his brother Isaa - Hakam - Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa - Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"I: saw Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) raise his hands when he commenced the Salaat. Then he would not raise his hands until he completed (the Salaat)." (Abu Dawood)

Proof 18

Abu Bakr Bin Abi Shaibah - Wakee' - Ibn Abi Lailaa - Hakam and Isaa - Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa - Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"Verily, when Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) commenced the Salaat, he would raise his hands, then he would not raise them (again) until he had completed (the Salaat)." (Abu

Bakr Bin Abi Shaibah)

Proof 19

Tahaawi - Abu Bakrah - Muammal - Sufyaan - Yazeed Bin Abi Ziyaad Ibn Abi Lailaa - Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

“When Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would recite Takbeer for beginning the Salaat, he would raise his hands until his thumbs were near to the lobes of his ears. He would then NOT repeat (Rafa' Yadain).” (Sharh Sunanul Aathaar)

Proof 20

Tahaawi - Ibn Abi Dawood - Amr Bin Aun - Khaalid - Ibn Abi Lailaa - Isaa Bin Abdur Rahmaan - from his father -Baraa' (Bin Aazib- radhiyallahu anhu) narrated from Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) Similar to the above Hadith (i.e. No. 19) (Sharh Sunanul Aathaar)

Proof 21

Tahaawi - Muhammad Bin Nu'maan - Yahya Bin Yahya-narrates from both:

1. Wakee' - Ibn Abi Lailaa - his brother
2. Hakam - Ibn Abi Lailaa

(both from) - Baraa Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) narrated from Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) a similar Hadith. (Sharhu Sunanul Aathaar)

Proof 22

Daara Qutni - Ahmad Bin Ali Bin Alalaa' - Abul Ash'ath - Muhammad Bin Bakr - Shu'ba - Yazeed Bin Abi Ziyaad said:

“I heard Ibn Lailaa say: ‘I heard Baraa (Bin Aazib) in this gathering speaking to people among whom was Ka'b Bin Ujrah. He (Baraa) said:

‘I saw Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) raising his hands when he commenced Salaat in the first Takbeer.’” (Daara Qutni)

Proof 23

Daara Qutni - Yahya Bin Muhammad Bin Saa-id- Muhammad Bin Sulaimaan Luwain - Ismaaeel Bin Zakariyya - Yazeed Bin Abi ZiyaadAbdur Rahmaan Bin Abi Lailaa - Baraa (Bin

Aazib - radhiyallahu anhum) saw Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) raising his hands at the time of commencing the Salaat until he brought them in line with his ears. Thereafter he would not at all repeat it (Rafa' Yada'in) until he had completed his Salaat." (Daara Qutni)

In other words, after Salaat Sayyidina RasuluUah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would lift his hands when making dua.

Proof 24

Daara Qutni - Ibn Saa'id - Luwain - Ismaaeel Bin Zakariyya - Yazid Bin Abi Ziyaad - Adi Bin Thaabit - Baraa Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) narrated similarly. (Daara Qutni)

Proof 25

Daara Qutni - Abu Bakr al-Aadami Abroad Bin Ismaaeel- Abdullah Bin Muhammad Bin Ayyub al-Makhrami _ Ali Bin Aasim - Muhammad Bin Abi Lailaa - Yazid Bin Abi Ziyaad - Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa - Baraa Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"I saw Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) when he stood for Salaat, reciting Takbeer and raising his hands until he brought them in line with his ears. Then he did not repeat it."

(Daara Qutni)

Besides the aforementioned authorities other Muhadditheen too have narrated the Hadith of Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu).

Some of the asaaneed (plural of sanad) of the Hadith of Baraa Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) are Jayyid (excellent) and Saheeh (authentic) in terms of the conditions of Bukhaari and Muslim or of one of them.

Among the Saheeh asaaneed of this Hadith is the sanad of Abdur Razzaaq. In his sanad are three narrators, viz. Ibn Uyainah, Yazid and Abdur 'Rahmaan.

With regard to Ibn Uyainah, the Muhadditheen pay glowing tribute to him. In his Tazkirah, Mulla Ali Qaari states that Sufyaan Ibn Uyainah was one of the most senior experts (Hafiz) of Hadith as well as a great expert of Fiqah. He is described as a great Imaam in Hadith, Fiqh and Fatwa.

Hafiz in At-Taqreeb has the same glowing titles for him. The compilers of Sihah Sittar narrate from him.

Regarding Yazid Bin Abi Ziyaad Al-Haashimi, the Muhadditheen differ. Bukhaari applied the principle of Ta'leeq to him. Muslim, Abu Dawood, Nasaai, Ibn Majah and Tirmithi have narrated his Hadith.

Regarding Abdur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa Al-Ansaari. He is a Taabi-ee who met 120 Sahaabah. According to the Muhadditheen, he is flawless. The compilers of the Sihah Sitta narrate his Ahaadith.

Thus, the sanad of Baraa's Hadith as narrated by Abdur Razzaaq is Saheeh in terms of the conditions of Bukhaari and Muslim.

Another Hadith on this issue, is the narration of Jaabir Bin Samurah (mdhiyallahu anhu) which is narrated in Saheeh Muslim.

Proof 26

Jaabir (radhiyallahu unhu) said:

"Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) came out (from his house) towards us and said: 'Why do I see you raising your hands as if (your hands) are the tails of mischievous horses. Be tranquil in Salaat.'"

According to Imaam Bukhaari, this Hadith does not support the Hanafi claim because Abdullah Bin al-Qibti narrates that Jaabir Bin Samurah (radhiyallahu anhu) said:

"We use to perform Salaat behind Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam). When he said 'Assalamu Alaikum', we would indicate with our hands on both sides. Then Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) said:

"What is wrong with these people? They point with their hands (i.e. raising them) as if their hands are the tails of mischievous horses. It suffices to place the hands on the thighs, then making salaam to his brother on his right and left side."

The Ahnaaf counter this argument by averring that these are two different Hadiths. The one narrated earlier (No. 26) refers to Rifa' Yada'in which is the issue now under discussion.

The other Hadith (which is narrated by Abdullah Bin al-Qibti) concerns the practice of raising the hands at the time of making Salaam at the end of Salaat. But this is not the topic being discussed here. This explanation has been tendered by Mulla Ali Qaari in Mirkaat, Sharah Mishkaat.

Imaam Jamaalud-Deen Zaila'i (rahmatullah alayhi) refuted the notion that both - Hadiths No. 26 and the one narrated by Abdullah Bin al-Qibti – are one and the same, stating that it is not said to a person raising his hands upon making salaam: "Be tranquil in Salaat". These words (Be tranquil in Salaat) are only said to a person who is still in Salaat; in the state of Ruku' or Sujood or when he stands up for the second, third or fourth rak'at. The application of these words to the latter sense is manifestly clear.

Both the Hadiths are therefore, not the same. The first was narrated by a certain raawi on a certain occasion whilst the second was narrated by another raawi on a separate occasion.

Furthermore, the wording of the two Hadiths negate beyond any doubt the possibility of the two being one and the same. In Hadith No. 26 the raawi says: Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) came out towards us and said ..." This indicates that Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) said these words when he entered the Masjid whilst the Sahaabah were engaged in Salaat.

In contrast, the second Hadith (Narrated by Abdullah Bin al-Qibti) states:

"When we used to perform Salaat behind Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam)..."

The context here (in the Hadith narrated by Abdullah Bin al-Qibti) shows that Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) spoke after having lead the Sahaabah in Jama'ah (congregational) Salaat when he (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) observed them raising their hands.

The above discussion is sufficient to dispel the opinion of Imaam Bukhaari and establish the view of the Ahnaaf that these (Hadiths No. 26 and the one narrated by Abdullah Bin al-Qibti) are two different Hadiths.

Proof 27

Another Hadith in substantiation of the Hanafi view is the narration of Hadhrat Ibn Abbaas (radhiyallahu anhu). The Hadith is narrated by Tibraani as follows:

Tibraani - Abelur Rahman Bin Abi Lailaa - Hakam - Miqsam - Ibn Abbaas (radhiyallahu anhu) said that Holy Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) said:

"Do not raise the hands except in seven places.

1. When commencing Salaat.
2. When entering Masjidul Haraam and seeing the Baitullah.

3. When standing on Marwah.
4. When making Wuqoof with the people in Arafaat.
5. At Muzdalifah.
6. At Maqaamain.
7. When pelting the Jamrah.”

(Tibraani)

Imaam Bukhaari narrated this Hadith in his Al-Muj~ad fi Rafi Yadain. Wakee' narrated this Hadith also, the sanad being as follows:

Wakee' - Ibn Abi Lailaa - Hakam - Miqsam- Ibn Abbaas (radhiyallahu anhu).

Proof 28

Another Hadith in support of the Hanafi view is the Hadith of Abbaad Bin Zubair (radhiyallahu anhu).

Baihaqi - Abdullah al-Hafiz - Abul Abbaas Muhammad Bin Ya'qoob Muhammad Bin Ishaq - Hasan Bin Rahee' - Hafs Bin Giyaath Muhammad Abi Yahya - Abbaad Bin Zubair who narrated the following Hadith:

“When Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) would open the Salaat, he would raise his hands in the beginning of Salaat. Thereafter he would not at all raise his hands until he completed (the Salaat).’ (Baihaqi)

Commenting on this narration, Imaam Baihaqi said:

“Abbaad is a Taabi-ee, hence this Hadith is of the Mursal category. A Mursal Hadith is acceptable by the Haharisi, especially if it belongs to the Quroon-e-Thalaathah and it is corroborated by other asaaneed.”

Mursal is a Hadith the sanad of which ends at a Tabi-ee - Such a Hadith is authentic - Various factors confer authenticity to a Mursal Hadith, e.g. Ahaadith on the same subject are narrated with other chains (asaaneed) by virtue of which these other Ahaadith acquire a higher status than the Mursal Hadith. Thus, when Ahaadith of a higher classification corroborate a Mursal Hadith, it is accepted as valid and authentic.

In his assessment of the above narration Allaamah Anwar Shah Kashmiri comments:

“I have scrutinized the narrators of its isnaad. The findings of my study indicate that this Hadith is Saheeh (authentic).

Hafiz (Ibn Hajr) gave a direction in ad-Diraayah to study its isnaad. I complied with his order and thoroughly researched it. It is Mursal Jayyid (excellent). If you desire to view my findings take a look at 'Nailul Farqadain'."

Proof 29

Ibn Abi Shaibah - Ibn Aadam - Ibn Ayyaash- Abdul Malik Ibnul JabrZubair Bin Adi - Ibraaheem - Al-Aswad who said:

"I performed Salaat with Umar (Ibn Khattaab - radhiyallahu anhu). He did not raise his hands any where in the Salaat, except when he opened the Salaat."

(Musannaf Ibn Abi Shaibah)

Daara Qutni has also narrated this Hadith with his sanad. Also Imaam Tahaawi has narrated this Hadith with his sanad.

The author of Bazlul Majhood states that the above Hadith is Saheeh (authentic). Although this Hadith is based only on the Raawi, Hasan Bin Ayyaash, he (Hasan Bin Ayyaash) is thiqah (reliable) and hujjat (a proof). This was said by Yahya Bin Ma'een. Ibn Turkemaani furthermore stated that the sanad (chain of narrators) of this Hadith is Saheeh conforming to the conditions laid down by Imaam Muslim.

Proof 30

Imaam Muhammad - Muhammad Bin Abaan Bin Saalih and Abu Bakr Bin Abdullah Nahshali - Aasim Bin Kulaib Jarri - from his father who was a companion of Hadhrat Ali (karramallah wajhah). He (Kulaib Jarri) said:

"Hadhrat Ali (karramallah wajhah) would raise his hands in Takbeer Ulaa, i.e. the Takbeer with which the Salaat is opened. Thereafter he never raised his hands anywhere in the Salaat.' (Muatta Imaam Muhammad)

Proof 31

Ibn Abi Shaibah - Abu Bakrah - Abu Ahmad - Abu Bakr Nahshali - Aasim Bin Kulaib - from his father"(Kulaib Jarri) who said:

"Ali (radhiyallahu anhu) would raise his hands in the first Takbeer of Salaat. Thereafter he would not raise his hands." (Ibn Abi Shaibah)

This very same Hadith has been narrated by Imaam Tahaawi with exactly the same sanad from Abu Bakrah.

Proof 32

Ibn Abi Shaibah - Abu Dawood - Ahmad Bin Yunus - Abu Bakr Nahshali Aasim - from his father who was the companion of Ali (radhiyallahu anhu) narrated from Hadhrat Ali the same narration (i.e. as in No. 31 above). (Ibn Abi Shaibah)

Tahaawi and Baihaqi have likewise narrated this Hadith with their respective chains of transmission.

Commenting on this narration, Imaam Tahaawi said that it is not conceivable that Hadhrat Ali (radhiyallahu anhu) would have deliberately abandoned Rafa' Yadain if it was the permanent practice of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam). Hence, it is evident that according to Hadhrat Ali (radhiyallahu anhu), the practice of Rafa' Yadain was abrogated.

Commenting on the sanad of this Hadith, Aini says in Sharh Bukhaari:

"The isnaad of the Hadith of Aasim Bin Kulaib is Saheeh in terms of the conditions of Imaam Muslim."

Hafiz said in ad-Diraayah:

"Its narrators are thiqah (reliable):"

Zaila'i said: "It is an authentic narration."

Proof 33

Imaam Muhammad - Thanri - Husain - Ibraaheem , Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) - he (i.e. Ibn Mas'ood) would raise his hands when opening Salaat.

(Muatta Imaam Muhammad)

Proof 34

Ibn Abi Shaibah - Wakee' - Masrood _ Abi Mas'ood - Ibraaheem narrated that Abdullah Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) would raise his hands in the beginning when commencing Salaat. Thereafter he would not raise his hands.

(Ibn Abi Shaibah)

Tahaawi also narrated this Hadith with his sanad. The isnaad of this Hadith is Mursal Jayyid. (Jayyid - a classification of Hadith stronger than even a Hasan Hadith.) The reason for this Hadith being classified as Mursal is that Ibraaheem never met Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu). However, this does not detract from the authenticity and strength of this narration since Ibraaheem was in the habit of omitting the narrators between him (Ibraaheem) and Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) when a great number of raawis had narrated the Hadith to him from Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu).

Imaam Tahaawi narrated the following dialogue between Ibraaheem (Nakha'i) and A'mash:

"A'mash: When you relate a Hadith to me please do name the chain of narrators.

Ibraaheem: When I say: 'Abdullah said,' it is only when a large number has narrated the Hadith to me from Abdullah, and if I say: 'So and so person narrated to me from Abdullah, it is when only that particular person has narrated to me."

The authenticity of the above Hadith (No. 34) is therefore not tainted in the least by the omission of the narrators between Ibraaheem and Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu). The great Muhaddith Daara Qutni after relating a tradition from Ibraaheem - Abdullah (Bin Mas'ood), acclaims:

"The fact is that despite this narration having an irsaal (omission of a narrator) in it, Ibraaheem Nakha'i is the most enlightened of all people with regard to Abdullah (Bin Mas'ood), his views and his verdicts. He (Ibraaheem) acquired that from his maternal uncles Alqamah, al-Aswad and Abdur Rahmaan, and from other senior students of Abdullah."

Proof 35

Imaam Muhammad - Muhammad Bin Abaan Bin Saalih-Abdul Aziz Bin Hakeem who said:

"I saw Ibn Umar (radhiyallahu anhu) raising his hands in line with his ears in the first Takbeer opening the Salaat and he did not raise his hands besides this (one occasion)." (Muatta Imaam Muhammad)

Proof 36

Ibn Abi Shaibah - Abu Bakr Bin Ayyaash - Husain - Mujaahid who said:

"I did not see Ibn Umar (radhiyallahu anhu) raising his hands except in the beginning of opening (the Salaat)." (Musannaf Ibn Abi Shaibah)

Proof 37

Tahaawi - Ibn Abi Dawood - Ahmad Bin Yunus - Abu Bakr Bin Ayyaash Husain - Mujaahid who said:

"I performed Salaat behind Ibn Umar (radhiyallahu anhu). He would not raise his hands except in the first Takbeer." (Sharh Ma-aanil Aathaar)

Commenting on this Hadith, Imaam Tahaawi said:

"This is Ibn Umar (radhiyallahu anhu) who has seen Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) making rafa' (raising the hands) then he abandoned it after Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam). It is inconceivable for this except that he was convinced of the abrogation of what he had seen Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) doing. Thus the proof for this has been established."

Imaam Ibn Humaam reports this narration in Tahreerul Usool. Similarly, Baihaqi in his al-Ma'rifah narrated it. The sanad of Tahaawi for this Hadith is Saheeh.

Ibn Abi Shaibah mentions the following authorities of the Shariah who negate Rafa' Yada'in at the time of ruku' and when rising from ruku': Hadhrat Ali (radhiyallahu anhu) and his companions, Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu), Ibraaheem Nakha'i, Haithamah, Qais, Ibn Abi Lailaa, Mujaahid, Alswad, Sha'bi, Abu Ishaq, Imaam Abu Hanifah, Imaam Maalik (rahmatullah alayhim), and others - all of whom are elite members of the Salaf-e-Saaliheen.

Proof 38

Abu Bakr Bin Ayyaash narrates that Mujaahid said:

"I performed Salaat behind Ibn Umar (radhiyallahu anhu) for a number of years (in one narration, ten years). He did not raise his hands except in Takbeer Ulaa (the first Takbeer)."

This sanad is Saheeh. When a Sahabi's action conflicts with his own narration, then in terms of the principles of Hadith, it (his action) indicate, abrogation of what he had narrated.

Al-Qastalaani in Sharh Bukhaari claims that Abu Bakr Bin Ayyaash, narrator in the sanad (of No. 38 above) is dhaeef (weak). However, this claim itself is weak and incorrect because Imaam Bukhaari and Imaam Muslim, both have declared him to be Thiqah (reliable,

authentic). They both narrate his ahaadith.

Furthermore, the Muhadditheen of the four other Saheeh compilations have also narrated his ahaadith. Hence, the statement by Qastalaani is unacceptable in view of his (Abu Bakr Bin Ayyaash's) ahaadith being accepted and narrated by Bukhaari and Muslim.

Also, Hafiz has praised him. Thauri, Ibn Mubaarak and Ibn Mahdi likewise lauded praise on him. Imaam Ahmad Bin Hambal said: "He (Ayyaash) is truthful". Yahya Bin Ma-een said: "He is Thiqaah."

Proof 39

It is narrated from Abu Hurairah (radhiyallahu anhu) that he used to raise his hands when commencing Salaat and he used to say in every descent and ascent (i.e. when going down and rising up): "Allaahu Akbar. He would say as well:

"I am more of a resemblance to the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) than you."

(Hafiz Abu Amr in al-Istithkaar and Aini in Mabaanil Akhbaar citing at-Tamheed)

Proof 40

Ahmad bin Yoonus - Abu Bakr Bin Ayyaash:

"I never saw a Faqeeh doing it; raising his hands in other than the first Takbeer." (Tahaawi)

Proof 41

Yet another Hadith in substantiation of the Hanafi practice of only raising the hands at the beginning of Salaat is one narrated by Baihaqi in al-Khilaafiyyaat and Zaila'i in Nasbur Raayah from Ibn Umar (radhiyallahu anhu):

"Verily, Nabi (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) used to raise his hands when commencing Salaat. Then he would not do so again."

Haakim said that this Hadith is Baatil (false) and Mawdhoo' (fabricated). However this claim of Haakim is itself Baatil. The Ahnaaf state that Haakim's claim is utterly baseless. Haakim could not find anyone on the sanad of the Hadith whom he could disparage.

Shaikh Aahid as-Sindi averred that its narrators are authentic and reliable. This he stated in

al-Mawaahibul Lateefah.

It should be borne in mind that Hadhrat Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) was a very senior Sahaabi who was constantly in the company of Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam), so much so, that the impression of him being a member of the Ahl-e-Bait (Rasulallah's family) was created. He followed Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) in all five Salaat on a daily basis. Hence, his explicit negation of Rafa' Yada'in categorically confirms that Rasulallah (Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam) had discontinued the earlier practice of raising the hands.

An argument advanced to refute the Hanafi argument is that the Hadith of Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) has been proclaimed to be dhaeef since one of the narrators in one of the Chains is Muhammad Bin Abi Lailaa who has been described as dhaeef by Abu Dawood. This argument holds no substance because the Hanafi case is not based solely on the Hadith of Baraa Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) with the sanad in which Muhammad Bin Abi Lailaa appears. There are a number of Saheeh asaaneed (Chains of narration) in which Muhammad Bin Abi Lailaa does not feature at all. Thus, the many other Saheeh asaaneed serve to corroborate the sanad in which Muhammad Bin Abi Lailaa features. The cumulative effect of the Saheeh asaaneed of the Hadith of Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) elevates the sanad in which appears Muhammad Bin Abi Lailaa, hence that Hadith too is acceptable.

Furthermore, some of these ahaadith are authentic in terms of the conditions of either both Bukhaari and Muslim or in terms of the conditions of one of them, especially the sanad of Abdur Razzaaq. The authenticity of Abdur Razzaaq's sanad is based on the conditions of both EI-Bukhaari and Muslim.

The argument that Yazeed Bin Ziyaad in this sanad is weak, is not valid because in Sharhul Bukhaari, Aini states:

"Undoubtedly, this Yazeed has been authenticated (declared as Thiqah) by Al-Ajli, Ya'qoob Bin Sufyaan, Ahmad Bin Saalih, Sabaahi and Ibn Hibbaan."

Also Muslim and Ibn Khuzaimah record his narration in their Saheeh. Moreover, Yazeed is not the solitary narrator of this Hadith. Isaa Abdur Rahmaan too narrated it from Ibn Abi Lailaa. Similarly, Hakam has narrated it also from Ibn Abi Lailaa as recorded by Abu Dawood and others. In his Tahzeeb, Hafiz says that Muslim has also narrated the Hadith of Yazeed.

Since this narrator, viz. Yazeed, is among the narrators of Saheehain (Bukhaari and Muslim), no credence can be accorded to anyone who seeks to impugn him.

Shah Anwar Kashmiri states in Nailul Farqadain:

“At this juncture one should not forget that the view of those who do not make Raf' Yadain is 'Admi' (i.e. they prove the non-existence or a certain act.). Taking this into account, their view is also supported by all those Ahaadith which describe the Salaat of Rasullullah Sallallahu alayhi wa Sallam but make no mention of Raf' Yadain, neither affirming it nor denying it. This is so because, had there been Raf' Yadain, these Ahaadith would not have been silent on the issue.”

In view of what Hadhrat Shah Kashmiri Sahib has stated, the Ahaadith that support the Hanafi view are indeed numerous. It would require a few volumes to attempt to record them. In this brief booklet only those Ahaadith have been recorded that explicitly negate Raf' Yadain.

Conclusion

The Hadith narrations presented in this treatise in substantiation of the Hanafi viewpoint are all Saheeh (authentic) according to the Muhadditheen, including Shaikhaan (i.e. Imaam Bukhaari and Imaam Muslim).

All unbiased Muslims who are in pursuit of the truth will understand after having studied this short treatise, that the Hanafi practice of refraining from Rafa' Yadain is not based on only rational/logical arguments, but is the product of authentic narrational evidence (Ahaadith). In view of the validity of the arguments and grounds of the Hanafi Mathhab, there is no controversy among the followers of the four Madhhabs on this issue. Each one follows the teachings of his Mathhab without attempting to denigrate the followers of the other Mathaahib.

Only followers of baatil such as the modernist Najdis, are bigoted in the matter of valid ikhtilaafaat (differences) based on Haqq (Truth). It is their baatil which constrains them to embark on their pernicious exercises of disparaging Al-Imaam Al-A'zam Abu Hanifah (rahmatullah alayhi) in particular. But the Truth cannot be suppressed for too long.

"Truth has come and falsehood has perished. Verily falsehood (by its very nature) is perishable" (Holy Qur'aan)

» Posted by abu mohammed on 7th November 2010

[edit this entry]

Tweet

7 Comments

zakirfan1 wrote on 15/04/2011:

Assalam O Alaikum....

You rightly quoted the verse from HOLY QURAN:

"Truth has come and falsehood has perished. Verily falsehood (by its very nature) is perishable" (17:81)

Let us analyse what basically the truth and falsehood is under the light of AUTHENTIC HADITH....

I would like to give you some evidences from SIHA-E-SITTA that proves that PROPHET MOHAMMAD (P.B.U.H) and sahabas did raised their hands in other occasion other than takbir-e-tehreema.....

This is Ijmat-ul-mumineen that SAHIH BUKHARI is the most authentic book after GLORIOUS QURAN..... i would like you to look at these narrations of SAHIH BUKHARI and other authentic books before making any conclusion.....

(1) Bukhari :Characteristics of Prayer : Book 1 :: Volume 12 :: Hadith 702

Narrated Salim bin 'Abdullah:

My father said, "Allah's Apostle used to raise both his hands up to the level of his shoulders when opening the prayer; and on saying the Takbir for bowing. And on raising his head from bowing he used to do the same and then say "Sami a-l-lahu Liman hamida, Rabbana walaka-l-hamd." And he did not do that (i.e. raising his hands) in prostrations.

(2) Bukhari :Characteristics of Prayer : Book 1 :: Volume 12 :: Hadith 703

Narrated 'Abdullah bin 'Umar:

I saw that whenever Allah's Apostle stood for the prayer, he used to raise both his hands up to the shoulders, and used to do the same on saying the Takbir for bowing and on raising his head from it and used to say, "Sami a-l-lahu Liman hamida". But he did not do that (i.e. raising his hands) in prostrations.

(3) Bukhari :Characteristics of Prayer : Book 1 :: Volume 12 :: Hadith 704

Narrated Abu Qilaba:

I saw Malik bin Huwairith saying Takbir and raising both his hands (on starting the prayers and raising his hands on bowing and also on raising his head after bowing. Malik bin Huwairith said, "Allah's Apostle did the same."

(4) Bukhari :Characteristics of Prayer : Book 1 :: Volume 12 :: Hadith 705

Narrated 'Abdullah bin 'Umar:

I saw Allah's Apostle opening the prayer with the Takbir and raising his hands to the level of his shoulders at the time of saying the Takbir, and on saying the Takbir for bowing he did the same; and when he said, "Sami a-l-lahu Liman hamida ", he did the same and then said, "Rabbana wa laka-l-hamd." But he did not do the same on prostrating and on lifting the head from it."

(5) Bukhari :Characteristics of Prayer : Book 1 :: Volume 12 :: Hadith 706

Narrated Nafi':

Whenever Ibn 'Umar started the prayer with Takbir, he used to raise his hands: whenever he bowed, he used to raise his hands (before bowing) and also used to raise his hands on saying, "Sami a-l-lahu Liman hamida", and he used to do the same on rising from the second Rak'a (for the 3rd Rak'a). Ibn 'Umar said: "The Prophet used to do the same."

(6) Dawud :Prayer (Kitab Al-Salat): Details of Commencing Prayer : Book 3 : Hadith 725

Narrated Wa'il ibn Hujr:

I purposely looked at the prayer of the Apostle of Allah (peace_be_upon_him), how he offered it. The Apostle of Allah (peace_be_upon_him) stood up, faced the direction of the qiblah and uttered the takbir (Allah is most great) and then raised his hands in front of his ears, then placed his right hand on his left (catching each other).

When he was about to bow, he raised them in the same manner. He then placed his hands on his knees. When he raised his head after bowing, he raised them in the like manner. When he prostrated himself he placed his forehead between his hands.

He then sat down and spread his left foot and placed his left hand on his left thigh, and kept his right elbow aloof from his right thigh. He closed his two fingers and made a circle (with the fingers).

I (Asim ibn Kulayb) saw him (Bishr ibn al-Mufaddal) say in this manner. Bishr made the circle with the thumb and the middle finger and pointed with the forefinger.

(7) Dawud :Prayer (Kitab Al-Salat): Details of Commencing Prayer : Book 3 : Hadith 743

Narrated Ali ibn AbuTalib:

When the Apostle of Allah (peace_be_upon_him) stood for offering the obligatory prayer, he uttered the takbir (Allah is most great) and raised his hands opposite to his shoulders; and he did like that when he finished recitation (of the Qur'an) and was about to bow; and he did like that when he rose after bowing; and he did not raise his hands in his prayer while he was in his sitting position.

When he stood up from his prostrations (at the end of two rak'ahs), he raised his hands likewise and uttered the takbir (Allah is most great) and raised his hands so as to bring them

up to his shoulders, as he uttered the takbir in the beginning of the prayer.

(8) Dawud :Prayer (Kitab Al-Salat): Details of Commencing Prayer : Book 3 : Hadith 957

Narrated Wa'il ibn Hujr:

I said that I should look at the prayer of the Apostle of Allah (peace_be_upon_him) how he prays. The Apostle of Allah (peace_be_upon_him) stood up and faced the qiblah (i.e. the direction of Ka'bah) and uttered the takbir (Allah is most great); then he raised his hands till he brought them in front of his ears; then he caught hold of his left hand with his right hand (i.e. folded his hands).

When he was about to bow, he raised them (his hands) in a like manner. Then he sat, stretched out his left foot (to sit on it), placed his left hand on his left thigh, and kept away the tip of his right elbow from his right thigh, joined two fingers, formed a ring, to do so. And the narrator Bishr made a ring with the thumb and the middle finger.

(9) Dawud ::Prayer (Kitab Al-Salat): Details of Commencing Prayer : Book 3 : Hadith 737

Narrated AbuHurayrah:

When the Apostle of Allah (peace_be_upon_him) uttered the takbir (Allah is most great) for prayer (in the beginning), he raised his hands opposite to his shoulders; and when he bowed, he did like that; and when he raised his head to prostrate, he did like that; and when he got up at the end of two rak'ahs, he did like that.

(10) Muslim :The Book of Prayers (Kitab Al-Salat): Book 4 : Hadith 792

Wa'il b. Hujr reported: He saw the Apostle of Allah (may peace be upon him) raising his hands at the time of beginning the prayer and reciting takbir, and according to Hammam (the narrator), the hands were lifted opposite to ears. He (the Holy Prophet) then wrapped his hands in his cloth and placed his right hand over his left hand. And when he was about to bow down, he brought out his hands from the cloth, and then lifted them, and then recited takbir and bowed down, and when (he came back to the erect position) he recited:" Allah listened to him who praised Him." And when prostrates. he prostrated between the two palms.

(11) Muslim ::The Book of Prayers (Kitab Al-Salat): : Book 4 : Hadith 761

Abu Qilaba reported that he saw Malik b. Huwairith raising his hands at the beginning of prayer and raising his hands before kneeling down, and raising his hands after lifting his head from the state of kneeling, and he narrated that the Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) used to do like this.

(12) Muslim :The Book of Prayers (Kitab Al-Salat): : Book 4 : Hadith 759

Ibn Umar reported that the Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him), when he stood up for prayer, used to raise his hands apposite the shoulders and then recited takbir (Allah-o-Akbar), and when he was about to bow he again did like it and when he raised himself from the ruku' (bowing posture) he again did like it, but he did not do it at the time of raising his

head from prostration.

(13) Muslim :The Book of Prayers (Kitab Al-Salat): : Book 4 : Hadith 758

Salim narrated it on the authority of his father who reported: I saw the Messenger of Allah (may peace be upon him) raising his hands apposite the shoulders at the time of beginning the prayer and before bowing down and after coming back to the position after bowing. but he did not raise them between two prostrations.

(14) Malik :Prayer: Book 3 : Hadith 3.5.17

Yahya related to me from Malik from Ibn Shihab from Salim ibn Abdullah from Abdullah ibn Umar that the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless him and grant him peace, used to raise his hands to the level of his shoulders when he began the prayer and when he raised his head from the ruku he raised them in the same way, saying, "Allah hears whoever praises him, our Lord and praise belongs to You." He did not raise them in the sujud.

(15) Malik :Prayer: Book 3 : Hadith 3.5.21

Yahya related to me from Malik from Ibn Shihab from Salim ibn Abdullah that Abdullah ibn Umar used to say "Allah is greater" in the prayer whenever he lowered himself and raised himself.

Yahya related to me from Malik from Nafi that Abdullah ibn Umar used to raise his hands to the level of his shoulders when he began the prayer and when he raised his head from the ruku he would raise them less than that.

CONCLUSION:

I would just like to say that we respect all school of thoughts and follow them until or unless they donot contradict the GLORIOUS QURAN and authentic teachings of our beloved PROPHET MOHAMMAD (P.B.U.H).....

For you imam Abu Hanifah (may ALLAH be please with him) may be IMAM-E-AZAM but for a true believer only PROPHET MUHAMMAD (P.B.U.H) is worth of the title like IMAM-UL-ANBIYA, IMAM-E-AZAM, QUAID-E-AZAM etc....

For a true believer one authentic evidence is enough to convince him and drag him to the right path.... As ALLAH says in GLORIOUS QURAN:

"ONLY THOSE BELIEVE IN OUR SIGNS, WHO, WHEN THEY ARE RECITED TO THEM, FALL DOWN IN ADORATION, AND CELEBRATE THE PRAISES OF THEIR LORD, NOR ARE THEY (EVER) PUFFED UP WITH PRIDE." (32:15)

Hope you keep your PRIDE aside and accept the TRUTH.... :)

Looking forward for your reply...

Reply:

Salaam. Jazakallah for your comment. I am not denying that the Raful Yadain was never done or is invalid. It "was" still a Sunnah that we do not deny.

Dont you find it rather strange that the narrations regarding the Prophet performing raful yadain were done and are mentioned in Sahih Bukhari.

If we were to only look at Sahih Bukhari (for example, as this is the second most authentic book on the face of the planet, and by the way, if that is the case, then why have some Imams decided to reject some hadith as weak or maybe even fabricated) "show me how I should urinate", and show me where it says to say Ameen LOUD according to imam Bukhari, as is claimed by many liars. Please show me the word LOUD in the Arabic text from Bukhari. (I am not denying that it is not mentioned in other books, but every one seems to claim that it is in Bukhari)

After providing me the answer to ther above, then go on to read the rest.

Dont you find it strange that the Hadith mentioned in the evidences provided were collected before Imam Bukhari was born.

Havent you taken into consideration that Imam Bukhari had very strict rules before accepting Hadith.

Havent you taken into consideration that by the time the Hadith got to Imam Bukhari, his rules would have been broken.

Havent you taken into consideration that Imam Bukhari him self said that he has only written a fraction of the Hadith in his 9 volume work and that he has left out much much more.

Havent you taken into consideration that 22 of the 23 Imams (teachers) from the Thulathiyaat only, were practising on the fiqh of Imam Abu Hanifa.

Havent you taken into consideration the Hadith books written before any of these Hadith Imams were born.

Havent you taken into consideration the Imam whom Imam Bukhari him self said that he was the only one who knew more hadith than him, and that he was of the Hanafi fiqh.

Havent you.....

Taken into consideration the other Hadith also narrated in the same books?

Uthmaan Bin Abi Shaibah – Wakee’ – Sufyaan – Aasim (Ibn Kulaib) – Abdur Rahman Bin Aswad – Alqamah said: Abdullah Bin Mas’ood (radhiyallahu anhu) said: ‘Should I not perform with you the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim)?’ Alqamah said: ‘Then he (Ibn Mas’ood) performed Salaat and he did not raise his hands except once.’

(Abu Dawood)

Hasan Bin Ali – Muaawiyah – Khaalid Bin Amr Bin Saeed – Abu Huzaifah. They said Sufyaan narrated to us with this same isnaad (as mentioned in No.1 above). He said: 'He (Ibn Mas'ood) raised his hands in the beginning once.' Some narrators said: 'one time'.

(Abu Dawood)

Abu Dawood – Muhammad Bin Sabaah al-Bazzaar – Shareek- Yazid Bin Abi Ziyaad – Abdur Rahmaan Bin Abi Lailaa – Baraa' (radhiyallahu anhu) said: "Verily, Rasulullah (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim) would raise his hands near to his ears when he opened (i.e. began) the Salaat, then he would not repeat (it)."

(Abu Dawood)

Abu Dawood – Husain Bin Abdur Rahmaan – Wakee' – Ibn Abi Lailaa – his brother Isaa – Hakam – Abdur Rahmaan Bin Abi Lailaa – Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said: "I saw Rasulullah (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim) raise his hands when he commenced the Salaat. Then he would not raise his hands until he completed (the Salaat)."

(Abu Dawood)

Also from the Imam whom most ghair Muqallids claim to follow:

Wakee' – Sufyaan – Aasim Bin Kulaib – Abdur Rahmaan Bin al-Aswad Alqamah said: "Ibn Mas'ood (radhiyallahu anhu) said: 'Should I not perform for you the Salaat of Rasulullah (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim)?' He then performed Salaat and he did not raise his hands except once."

(Ahmad in his Musnad)

Imaam Ahmad -Hushaim – Yazeed Bin Abi Ziyaad – Abdur Rahmaan Bin Abi Lailaa – Baraa' Bin Aazib (radhiyallahu anhu) said: "When Rasulullah (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim) recited Takbeer, he would raise his hands until we could see his thumbs near to his ears. Then he would not repeat (Rafa' Yadain) in that Salaat."

(Musnad Ahmad ibn Hanbal)

Also:

Another Hadith in substantiation of the Hanafi view is the narration of Hadhrat Ibn Abbaas (radhiyallahu anhu). The Hadith is narrated by Tibraani as follows: Tibraani – Abelur Rahmaan Bin Abi Lailaa – Hakam – Miqsam – Ibn Abbaas (radhiyallahu anhu) said that Holy Nabi (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim) said: "Do not raise the hands except in seven places.

- 1) When commencing Salaat.
- 2) When entering Musjidul Haraam and seeing the Baitullah.
- 3) When standing on Marwah.
- 4) When making Wuqoof with the people in Arafaat.

- 5) At Muzdalifah.
 - 6) At Maqaamain.
 - 7) When pelting the Jamrah.”
- (Tibraani)

Imaam Bukhaari narrated this Hadith in his Al-Mujad fi Rafi Yadain.

Wakee' narrated this Hadith also, the sanad being as follows: Wakee' – Ibn Abi Lailaa – Hakam – Miqsam- Ibn Abbaas (radhiyallahu anhu).

And..

Ibn Abi Shaibah – Abu Dawood – Ahmad Bin Yunus – Abu Bakr Nahshali Aasim – from his father who was the companion of Ali (radhiyallahu anhu) narrated from Hadhrat Ali the same narration (i.e. as in No. 31 above).
(Ibn Abi Shaibah)

Tahaawi and Baihaqi have likewise narrated this Hadith with their respective chains of transmission.

Commenting on this narration, Imaam Tahaawi said that it is not conceivable that Hadhrat Ali (radhiyallahu anhu) would have deliberately abandoned Rafa' Yadain if it was the permanent practice of Rasulullah (Sall Allahu alaihi wa Aalihi wa Sallim). Hence, it is evident that according to Hadhrat Ali (radhiyallahu anhu), the practice of Rafa' Yadain was abrogated.

Commenting on the sanad of this Hadith, Aini says in Sharh Bukhaari: “The isnaad of the Hadith of Aasim Bin Kulaib is Saheeh in terms of the conditions of Imaam Muslim.”

Hafiz said in ad-Diraayah: “Its narrators are thiqah (reliable):”

Zaila'i said: “It is an authentic narration.”

http://www.muftisays.com/blog/abu+mohammed/546_07-11-2010/rafal-yadain.html